Building Communicative Competencies for Future Leaders: An Analysis of Public Administration Curricula in Kazakhstan

Zhazira Iskindirova[a], Baurzhan Bokayev[b], Zulfiya Torebekova[c], & Zhuldyz Davletbayeva*[d]

* Corresponding author
Email:
a. L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Astana, Kazakhstan.
b. Syracuse University, Syracuse, USA.
c. Center for Research and Evaluation, Astana, Kazakhstan.
d. Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Astana, Kazakhstan.

How to cite
 Iskindirova, Z., Bokayev, B., Torebekova, Z., & Davletbayeva, Z. (2024). Building Communicative Competencies for Future Leaders: An Analysis of Public Administration Curricula in Kazakhstan. *Journal of Curriculum Studies Research*, 6(2), 70-87.
https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2024.11

ABSTRACT

This study aims to identify issues related to developing communicative competencies among public servants by examining the educational programs, catalogs of academic disciplines, and competency models of graduate programs in Public and Local Administration at universities in Kazakhstan. We analyzed publicly available information from higher education institutions' web pages on training programs, course descriptions, and key competencies in relevant fields. It was revealed that universities in Kazakhstan provide limited information about their programs, thus we referred to comprehensive data from unified higher ed platform from Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The analysis indicates that program administrators often neglect communicative competencies while building curricula. In most cases, they are subject to specific courses such as Governance Psychology and Human Resources, with the content varying considerably from one university to another. The Academy of Public Administration under the President of Kazakhstan is the only institution offering robust courses dedicated to this area. The expected outcomes include skills in public speaking, interaction with the public and media, business correspondence, conflict resolution, and knowledge of organizational culture and ethical behavior. Considering the importance and growing attention to the effect of the communication skills of civil servants for public satisfaction, this study concludes that Kazakh universities should ensure the inclusion of communication competencies into Public Administration programs. Such additions could enhance the preparation of prospective public servants, aiding them in their professional roles and during employment selection processes.

KEYWORDS

Communicative competencies; curriculum; public administration; civil servants.

INTRODUCTION

In an increasingly interconnected world, the role of civil servants has evolved beyond traditional administrative functions to encompass a broader range of responsibilities that demand effective communication, leadership, and interpersonal skills. Globally, there is a growing recognition of the necessity for public administrators to possess strong communicative competencies to navigate complex governance environments, engage with diverse stakeholders, and drive public sector innovation. This global trend reflects a shift from a focus on technical skills alone to a more holistic approach that integrates communicative prowess as a core component of effective public service.

In many countries, including Kazakhstan, the emphasis on developing communicative skills within public administration education has gained traction. The ability to convey information clearly, manage conflicts, and engage in constructive dialogue is critical for public officials who must often bridge gaps between government institutions and the public, mediate between competing interests, and lead organizational change. As a result, educational institutions are increasingly tasked with incorporating these competencies into their curricula to better prepare future leaders for the demands of modern governance.

This research article seeks to address the evolving needs of public administration education by evaluating how well Kazakhstan's universities integrate communicative competencies into their master's programs in Public and Local Administration. The study aims to explore the extent to which these programs equip students with the necessary skills to excel in a dynamic public service environment.

The goal of this research is twofold: first, to assess the current state of communicative competency training within public administration programs in Kazakhstan; and second, to identify areas for improvement in the educational process that can better align with global trends and demands. By analyzing educational programs, course catalogs, and competency models, this study seeks to answer several key research questions:

- To what extent do Kazakhstan's universities include communicative competencies in their public administration curricula?
- Which specific communicative skills are emphasized, and how are they integrated into the educational programs?
- How do the communicative competency training components compare across different institutions?
- What gaps exist in the current curricula, and how can they be addressed to better prepare future leaders for the challenges of public administration?

By answering these questions, this research aims to contribute to the ongoing discourse on enhancing public administration education and ensuring that future leaders are well-equipped to meet the evolving needs of public service in Kazakhstan and beyond.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The primary responsibility of civil servants is to serve the public, complemented by the competencies of communication and engaging with citizens (Ulrich, 2000; Vigoda, 2002). The existing research refers to competencies as subject-expertise or individual accomplishment, organizational capability, excellence-associated behavioral qualities, and the minimal skills needed to perform particular professions (Hood & Lodge, 2004).

Spencer and Spencer (1993) provide characterization on the competencies, indicating two types of competence in the context of work in general. The first group of competencies is referred to as threshold competencies, and it consists of the information and abilities necessary to do a task. Differentiating competencies refer to the second group of competencies that set the exceptional apart from the mediocre. People with outstanding competencies are not the same as people with average competencies. According to Lodge and Hood (2005), the fourth connotation is associated with the threshold competencies, whereas the third is associated with the differentiating competencies.

Numerous prior research works have investigated the variables influencing public service quality and how tangibles can help to raise public service quality (Tuzcuoğlu et al. 2022; Yildirim et al., 2019). Others looked at the impact of service providers' responsiveness on community service delivery (Hermawan Saputra, 2021). One may classify this aspect as a component of responsiveness and reliability. additionally, a contributing aspect of public satisfaction is aspect of assurance, which can be characterized by civil servants' competence, politeness, and capacity to cultivate client confidence (Aoki, 2021; Ocampo, 2019). It includes such elements as expertise, security, communication, credibility, and civility. Components of assurance and empathy are similar in that they both call for effective communication from service providers, which may result in a favorable reaction from clients (Ocampo, 2019).

Research on communication skills in public services is generally lacking despite multiple prior researches demonstrating the significance of assurance and empathy as two critical factors to consider when enhancing public service quality. Idayati et al. (2020) and Matraeva et al. (2020) note that most research on assurance and empathy focuses on knowledge or cognitive components of service providers.

Scholars note that service providers must naturally be able to respectfully and correctly convey their opinions and recommendations to service users (Engdaw, 2020). It highlights that communication skills are crucial in the public sector. In addition to ensuring public satisfaction, effective communication can increase the effectiveness of government services provided (Rivai et al., 2022). Numerous prior studies have already demonstrated how communication competencies help employees perform their jobs more effectively by encouraging interaction among coworkers, fostering positive relationships between leaders and employees, and promoting communication (Al Jahwari, 2023; Carmody et al., 2011).

Head (2007) contends that civil servants should develop every aspect of communication. This is because public officials work for the public sector, which aims to build relationships with

citizens and consider their individual needs and complaints (Jianu et al., 2013). Public communication is crucial in constructing good governance, which benefits citizens (Aji et al., 2018).

Communicative competencies also comprise such qualities of civil servants as the ability to understand clients (Eggers et al., 2021), identify what is valuable to analyze different positions, and advise citizens in choosing services (Hartley et al., 2015).

Particular emphasis has been given to communicating constructively with clients to prevent conflicts and build interaction despite emerging obstacles (Jałocha et al., 2014). Adjustment to rapidly changing needs and civic orientation of public services presupposes the ability to interact with citizens in creative solutions and translate people's ideas into a pragmatic plane (Lees-Marshment, 2016).

In the characteristics of communication between a civil servant and a consumer of public services, the emphasis is on the emotional component: civil servants should be open souls, empathetic listeners, friendly, accessible, and respectful (Coste & Tiron-Tudor, 2013; Lees-Marshment, 2016; Vaidelytė & Sodaitytė, 2017). Accordingly, managing personal emotions and self-control can also be associated with communicative competencies (Ilies, 2014; Zakrzewska, 2017). Constant interaction with citizens similarly requires the ability of civil servants to analyze different positions, attract individual and collective actors to cooperate, and overcome barriers to partnership (Clarke & Craft, 2019; Elmqvist et al., 2018; Jałocha et al., 2014).

Recent studies focused on the interpersonal communication skills of civil servants conclude that communication competencies of civil servants greatly effect on public satisfaction with public services (Bokayev et al., 2024a; Engdaw, 2020; Rivai et al., 2022). Communication abilities indicate the capacity of service providers to build confidence in service users and foster public trust via both verbal and nonverbal means. According to research, the ability of public service providers to communicate is a crucial factor that needs to be taken into account while providing public services (Bokayev et al., 2024b; Yildirim et al., 2019).

RESEARCH METHODS

This research utilizes a mixed methods approach to explore the integration of communicative competencies in public administration education programs at universities in Kazakhstan. It combines quantitative analysis of educational program data with qualitative content analysis of curriculum documents to offer a thorough understanding of how communicative skills are currently incorporated.

Data Collection

The study analyzed educational program descriptions, course catalogs, and competency models from 20 universities offering master's programs in Public and Local Administration in Kazakhstan. These 20 universities were selected from a total of 128 universities in Kazakhstan that offer programs in public administration. Data were collected from publicly available university websites and a centralized higher education platform, which is regulated for data

accuracy under Kazakhstan's Order No. 106 by the Minister of Science and Higher Education, dated October 12, 2022 (Kazakhstan Order No. 106, 2022). Additionally, the research ensured that the selected programs were pertinent to the study's objectives.

Data collection followed a systematic review process based on a search protocol that outlined databases and sources for identifying relevant educational programs. Keywords such as "public and local administration," "key competencies," "communication," "communicative skills," "public speech competencies," "civil servants," and "public service" were used in a stepwise search technique. This method enabled the researchers to pinpoint the most pertinent competencies and programs.

Quantitative Analysis

To quantify the extent of communicative competency integration, a detailed inventory of courses and competencies related to communication was created. This inventory includes the number of courses explicitly focused on communicative skills, the presence of these skills in core versus elective courses, and the frequency with which communicative competencies are mentioned in program descriptions and competency models. Descriptive statistics, such as frequency counts and percentage distributions, are used to provide an overview of how communicative competencies are represented across different institutions.

Qualitative Content Analysis

Qualitative content analysis is used to evaluate the depth and quality of communicative competency training within the curricula. This involves a detailed examination of course syllabi, learning outcomes, and competency models in Public and Local Administration to assess how communicative skills are taught and applied in practical contexts. The analysis focuses on identifying key themes related to communicative competencies, such as public speaking, conflict resolution, and interpersonal communication, and evaluating how these skills are embedded within the educational programs. The content analysis also includes a comparative assessment of how different institutions address communicative competencies and identifies any gaps or inconsistencies in the curricula.

Comparative Analysis

A comparative approach is used to analyze differences and similarities across universities. By comparing the integration of communicative competencies in various programs, the study identifies best practices and areas for improvement. This comparative analysis helps in understanding how different institutions prioritize and implement communicative skills training and provides insights into how curricula can be enhanced to better meet the needs of future public servants.

Validity and Reliability

To ensure the validity and reliability of the study, several measures were implemented. Triangulation was employed by combining both quantitative and qualitative methods to cross-verify findings from different data sources. Systematic Data Collection involved using a structured search protocol and detailed coding to minimize bias. Descriptive Statistics and

Comparative Analysis were used to confirm the accuracy and consistency of the quantitative data. For qualitative analysis, peer review and expert feedback were sought to validate the coding and thematic identification processes. These steps collectively ensured that the study's findings were robust and credible.

FINDINGS

Curriculum building in higher education of Kazakhstan

The competency-based higher education in Kazakhstan has developed in line with European standards as part of the country's integration into the Bologna process in 2010. Special attention was given to the development of academic autonomy of universities, expanding their academic freedom for curriculum building. The amendments to the Law on Education in 2018 endorsed the educational and managerial independence of universities. Since then, universities have been allowed to develop their own integrated and flexible curricula focused on the needs of the labor market. Universities have the right to develop and implement innovative educational programs (EP) containing new, qualitatively improved technologies, methods, and forms of education.

State compulsory educational standards (framework standards) of higher education approved by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education on July 20, 2022, define the content of higher education and training and set the requirements for the maximum academic load and the level of training for students. Requirements of the Framework standard are mandatory in the design and development of curriculum for courses or disciplines.

According to the State compulsory educational standards of higher and postgraduate education, the curricula are composed of two components: *the compulsory component and the non-compulsory or elective component.* Kazakh universities can independently set the elective part of the curricula at the bachelor's level up to 70%, at the master's level - up to 80%, and at the doctoral level - up to 90%.

When designing learning outcomes, it is necessary to consider that the educational program equips graduates with behavioral skills and personal qualities (soft skills), professional skills (hard skills), and digital skills.

The content of professional curricula of higher education includes the study of a cycle of general education courses, the cycle of basic courses, the cycle of major ones, and professional practice in relevant specialties. Each cycle consists of courses that include a compulsory component and an optional component. Courses of the student's choice in each cycle must meaningfully complement the courses of the mandatory part.

When developing curricula for higher education, Kazakh universities typically use the following approaches:

- Analytical approach, when curricula specialists examine the labor market and employers' requirements for future specialists. It includes providing data-driven evidence (demands

of society, needs of the labor market) of the need to implement EP in the corresponding area of science and technology.

- A competency-based approach considers core and professional competencies following national and sectoral qualifications frameworks and future professional activities. It also includes information about employment opportunities, the professional field, and positions in which graduates can be employed based on professional standards.

- The practical training-oriented approach allows curricula developers to build relationships with employers on partnership terms. Employers take part in the development of curricula and in conducting examinations of the content of education programs. Responding to the requests and wishes of employers, curricula designers change the content of educational programs and expand the range of courses.

- Modular approach exhibits the curricula based on a modular presentation of educational information and interdisciplinary correspondences. The modular structure of the curriculum allows for quick and efficient expansion of the education program through the creation of modules, quickly responding to the requests of the labor market, and developing competencies that represent a comprehensive educational process.

- The integration approach considers building innovative curricula, including double-degree programs, with leading partner universities. An integration approach to the curricula helps to increase its attractiveness for foreign stakeholders (students, teaching staff, researchers).

Accordingly, educational programs and curricula are developed, approved, and implemented independently by universities for the entire period of study. The list of educational programs is typically established by the Academic Council of the university at the request of the labor market and potential employers.

Educational programs and curricula must reflect the university's commitment to the ideas of the Bologna process: learner-centered education, lifelong learning, competency-based education, and ensuring and improving quality.

Analysis of educational programs in Public Administration at Kazakh universities

This study analyzed educational programs of Kazakh universities providing graduate education in State and Local Administration to examine the presence of communicative competencies in the relevant curricula. Current analysis aims to determine whether the programs and training components included the necessary training of communicative competencies for prospective civil servants.

Analyses essentially capture institutions which possess publicly available information about academic courses, indicating the competencies that graduates receive upon completing their education. The official websites of universities typically contain information on a range of relevant coursers with a brief description of learning outcomes and key competencies that students receive throughout the courses.

The results show that Kazakh universities do not provide comprehensive information about the contents of their educational programs and courses. The complete descriptions of higher and postgraduate education curricula are available on a unified platform administered by the Ministry of Higher Education of Kazakhstan. This platform consists of comprehensive data on existing academic courses, with their whole description, including the number of credits, the study duration, date of approval, learning outcomes, etc.

Consequently, Kazakh higher education institutions, while describing their graduate programs and relevant curricula, merely underline the training objectives of EPs, general competencies acquired upon training, and potential internship and employment prospects. In addition, program administrators in State and Local Governments pay insufficient attention to developing the communicative competencies of prospective civil servants. Those necessary communication skills are somehow supplemented into elective courses such as Psychology of Management and Human Resources. Developing the communication skills of civil servants reflects activities related to teamwork and labor relations. In addition, the content of these courses varies from one university to another and does not fully cover expected communicative competencies.

Nevertheless, the highest number of courses containing communicative competencies are available in the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Academy presents at least four courses for developing communicative competencies of prospective civil servants. Among them are Formal writing and Public speaking, Professional communications, Conflict management, Organizational culture and Ethics, Collaborative and Participatory Governance, and Negotiation technologies. As indicated on the Academy's website, the expected learning outcomes within these courses include the development of public speaking skills, the ability to interact with the public and representatives of the media, business correspondence, negotiation skills, conflict resolution skills, as well as knowledge of the basis of organizational culture, ethical behavior of government employees.

When examining the educational programs and consistent curricula, it was also revealed that Kazakh universities generally underestimate the ethical norms and behavioral aspects of civil servants. This type of competency is closely related to communication skills and is a critical component in the professional duties of civil servants. Moreover, Kazakh civil servants must be acquainted with the Code of Ethics for Civil Servants. According to the information posted on the university websites, only several of them cover civil servant ethics. Among them are the Academy of Public Administration, the Humanitarian and Technical Academy, Turan-Astana, Innovative Eurasian University, and the Caspian University of Technologies and Engineering named after Sh. Yessenov, and Taraz Regional University named after M.Dulati.

Table 1 below (see Appendix) contains information about Kazakh universities offering graduate programs in State and Local Administration. It includes 20 universities with courses, capturing communicative competencies of civil servants.

DISCUSSION

In Kazakhstan, public administration training often perceived as a relatively new direction. In recent decades, higher education institutions have been required to include civil service capabilities in public administration courses due to public administration and public service reforms. Nevertheless, an analysis of earlier research in this area reveals a dearth of studies looking into public administration graduate program curricula in Kazakh universities. Yessimova and Yergaliyev (2023) report that upon comparing the Public Administration curricula of Kazakh universities' undergraduate and graduate programs, it was discovered that disciplines with an emphasis on research (37.9%), management (32.7%) and economics (21.1%) predominate in doctorate programs.

In their assessments of the present communication abilities among Kazakhstani civil servants, Bokayev et al. (2024a) revealed a lack of organized training and assistance for government workers to acquire efficient communication skills. According to Bokayev et al. (2024), several significant obstacles are preventing the development of communicative competencies among civil servants. These include the lack of standardized curricula, insufficient possibilities for specialized training, and constrained paths for professional advancement. Developing educational resources and implementing advanced training courses are two recommendations for enhancing the communication skills of civil servants.

The results of the current study highlight the differences in public administration programs between Kazakh universities. Apparently, competency-based curricula do not sufficiently target skill-based jobs in the public sector. Thus, standardizing a set of fundamental skills for government professionals pursuing degrees in public administration could contribute to maintaining consistency in curriculum and training throughout Kazakh colleges.

CONCLUSION

The results highlight that the Kazakh higher education system has been developing in line with contemporary professional and qualification standards. The integration into the European Higher Education zone allowed the academic freedom and institutional autonomy of Kazakh universities. The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Education, endorsed in 2018, expanded the academic and managerial independence of Kazakh universities and authorized them to develop independent education programs and customize curricula.

The regulations concerning new academic programs and curricula in Kazakhstan are uniform and do not depend on the type of university (private, state, national, or joint-stock). In addition, seventy percent of the content of academic programs is defined by universities (apart from regulated professions); the rest is prescribed by the Republic of Kazakhstan's State Compulsory Educational Standard.

However, the relevant communication-based curricula have not yet been properly developed in the country. Studying the content of courses and curricula in the Public Administration graduate program demonstrates the lack of key competencies necessary for

prospective civil servants. The graduate programs do not address the development of effective communication skills among prospective civil servants and targeted strategies to foster these competencies.

Meanwhile, contemporary studies highlight that the quality of public service often relates to professional competencies and personal characteristics of civil servants (Yildirim et al., 2019; Hermawan Saputra, 2021; Bokayev et al., 2024b). Among others, effective communication competencies positively impact public satisfaction with the public service system (Engdaw, 2020; Rivai et al., 2022; Bokayev et al., 2024a).

Thus, establishing unified core competencies of civil servants within Public Administration programs could potentially facilitate consistency among training programs and curricula across Kazakh universities. The current training programs in this field seem to employ multiple training models, making consistency across states hard to ascertain. Enhancing training programs with underlining communication and behavioral competencies of civil servants, including ethical norms, is crucial for improving public service delivery and enhancing governance effectiveness in the country.

For universities preparing prospective civil servants within the State and Local Administration programs, it is suggested to expand a range of courses focused on fostering communication competencies. The training approach and model of the Academy of Public Administration under the President of Kazakhstan can help develop relevant programs and competencies in other universities. It is also crucial to include skills necessary for civil servants according to the Code of Ethics for Civil Servants of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Moreover, knowledge of this document could help future civil servants when going through competitive stages of employment.

REFERENCES

Aji, G. G., Tsuroyya, & Dewi, P. A. R. (2018). Bridging communication between public and government: A case study on KIM Surabaya. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 953*(1), Article 012194. https://ui.adsabs.harvard.edu/abs/2018JPhCS.953a2194A/abstract

Al Jahwari, A., & Nur Ruzainy Alwi, M. (2023). The role of top management support and effective communication on succession planning effectiveness: An empirical study of Omani civil service organizations. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, *21*(3), 244–254. https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.21(3).2023.19

Aoki, N. (2021). The importance of the assurance that 'humans are still in the decision loop' for public trust in artificial intelligence: Evidence from an online experiment. *Computers in Human Behavior, 114,* 106572. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2020.106572

Bokayev, B., Davletbayeva, Z., Sadykova, K., Balmanova, A., & Baktiyarova, G. (2024a). Assessing communication competencies of public servants in Kazakhstan: Current status and approaches for enhancement. *Problems and Perspectives in Management, 22*(2), 667–682. https://doi.org/10.21511/ppm.22(2).2024.52

Bokayev, B., Zhanzhigitova, Z., Sadykova, K., & Balmanova, A. (2024b). Multichannel communication in Kazakhstani public service: Examining the role of digital tools. *Public Policy and Administration, 22(*4), 535–547. https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-23-22-4-11

Carmody, J., & Prideaux, B. (2011). Enhancing the Role of Host Communities in the Management of Protected Areas through Effective Two-way Communications: A Case Study. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, *16*(1), 89–104. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2011.539393

Clarke, A., & Craft, J. (2019). The twin faces of public sector design. *Governance, 32*(1), 5–21. https://doi.org/10.1111/gove.12321

Coste, A., & Tiron-Tudor, A. (2013). Service performance – Between measurement and information in the public sector. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences, 92*, 215–219. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.08.622

Eggers, W., Chew, B., Macmillan, P., Kohli, J., & Malik, N. (2021). Government as a cognitive system: Using hindsight, real-time data, and foresight to drive policy and decision-making. *In Government Trends 2021: Global transformative trends in the public sector* (pp. 60–71). Deloitte Development LLC.

Elmqvist, T., Siri, J., Andersson, E., Anderson, P., Bai, X., et al. (2018). Urban tinkering. *Sustainability Science, 13,* 1549–1564. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11625-018-0601-6

Engdaw, B. D. (2020). The impact of quality public service delivery on customer satisfaction in Bahir Dar city administration: The case of Ginbot 20 sub-city. *International Journal of Public Administration, 43*(7), 644–654. https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2020.1717905

Hartley, J., Alford, J., Hughes, O., & Yates, S. (2015). Public value and political astuteness in the work of public managers: The art of the possible. *Public Administration*, *93*(1), 195–211. https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12135

Head, B. (2007). The public service and government communication: Pressures and dilemmas. In S. Young (Ed.), *Government communication in Australia* (pp. 36-50). Cambridge University Press.

Hermawan Saputra, A. (2021). *Pengaruh kualitas pelayanan terhadap kepuasan pelanggan Auto 2000 Raden Intan Lampung.* Universitas Teknokrat Indonesia.

Hood, C., & Lodge, M. (2004). Competency, bureaucracy, and public management reform: A comparative analysis. *Governance: An International Journal of Policy and Administration, 17*(3), 313–333. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0952-1895.2004.00248.x

Idayati, I., Kesuma, I. M., Aprianto, R., & Suwarno, S. (2020). The effect of service quality on citizen expectations through dimensions of tangible, empathy, reliability, responsiveness, and assurance (TERRA). *Sriwijaya International Journal of Dynamic Economics and Business, 4*(3), 241–252. https://doi.org/10.29259/sijdeb.v4i3.241-252

Ilies, C.-O. S. (2014). What skills public sector leaders need in times of crises and economic recession? *Procedia Economics and Finance, 15*, 1556–1562. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(14)00680-3

Jałocha, B., Krane, H. P., Ekambaram, A., & Prawelska-Skrzypek, G. (2014). Key competences of public sector project managers. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences, 119*, 247–256. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.029

Jianu, E., Ciobanu, N., & Cioboată, R. (2018). Techniques and methods to improve the communication channels in modern public administration. *Social and Behavioral Sciences, 92*, 174-179. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/273852920_Techniques_and_Methods_to_Improve_the_Communication_Channels_in_Modern_Public_Administration

Kazakhstan Order No. 106 by the Minister of Science and Higher Education. (2022, October 12). *On the approval of the rules for maintaining the register of educational programs implemented by higher and/or postgraduate education organizations, as well as the grounds for inclusion in and exclusion from the register of educational programs*. https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2200030139/history

Lees-Marshment, J. (2016). Deliberative political leaders: The role of policy input in political leadership. *Politics and Governance, 4*(2), 25–35. https://doi.org/10.17645/pag.v4i2.614

Lodge, M., & Hood, C. (2005). Symposium Introduction: Competency and Higher Civil Servants. *Public Administration (London), 83*(4), 779–787. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0033-3298.2005.00475.x

Matraeva, L. V., Kaurova, O. V., Maloletko, A. N., & Vasiutina, E. S. (2020). Conceptual model to measure public service quality and service satisfaction: Russian practice. *Calitatea, 21*(177), 77–85. https://doi.org/10.24818/Calitatea/2020/21/177/12

Ocampo, L. (2019). Public service quality evaluation with SERVQUAL and AHP-TOPSIS: A case of Philippine government agencies. *Socio-Economic Planning Sciences, 68*, 100604. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seps.2019.100604

Order of the Minister of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. (2022). On approval of state compulsory standards of higher and postgraduate education. Available on Legal Information System of Regulatory Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan. https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017669

Rivai, A. M., Baharuddin, A., Syarifuddin, Seppa, Y. I., & Yusri. (2022). The Effect of Communication Skills of Civil Servant in Public Service on Community Satisfaction. *SHS Web of Conferences*, *149*, 3029-. https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/202214903029

Spencer, L. M., & Spencer, S. M. (1993). *Competence at work: Models for superior performance.* Wiley.

The Law on Education of Kazakhstan. (2007, July 27). № 319-III. Available on Legal Information System of Regulatory Legal Acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan. https://adilet.zan.kz/eng/docs/Z070000319

Tuzcuoğlu F., Akman E., Akman Ç., Aksu D. (2022). Public administration undergraduate education during the COVID-19*. Journal of Social Studies Education Research, 13* (2), 24 – 54. https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/3661/561

Ulrich, W. (2000). Reflective practice in civil society: The contribution of critically systematic thinking. *Reflective Practice, 1*(2), 247–268. https://doi.org/10.1080/14623940050020240

Vaidelytė, E., & Sodaitytė, E. (2017). Pasitenkinimas darbu Valstybės tarnybos departamente Lietuvoje: Išorinių ir vidinių veiksnių analizė. *Public Policy and Administration, 16*(3), 390–404. https://doi.org/10.1515/pp-2017-0021

Vigoda, E. (2002). Are you being served? The responsiveness of public administration to citizen demands: An empirical examination in Israel. *Public Administration, 78*(1), 165–191. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9299.00237

Yessimova, Sh. A., & Yergaliyev, D. N. (2023). Analysis and evaluation of educational program public and local administration: The case of Kazakhstan universities. *Economics: Strategy and Practice, 18*(1), 145–164. https://doi.org/10.51176/1997-9967-2023-1-145-164

Yildirim, K. E., Yildirim, A., & Ozcan, S. (2019). Integrated usage of the SERVQUAL and quality function deployment techniques in the assessment of public service quality: The case of Ardahan Municipality. *Business and Economic Research Journal, 10*(4), 885–901. https://doi.org/10.20409/berj.2019.214

Zakrzewska, M. (2017). The role of social participation in the concept of good governance: A theoretical approach. *Public Policy and Administration, 16*(4), 529–537. https://doi.org/10.1515/pp-2017-0031

Table 1

Graduate Programs in Public Administration

University name	Indication of communicative competencies	Disciplines for the development of communicative competencies	Source
Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan	Building effective communications - a civil servant must coordinate activities with colleagues, be open to communication, and show readiness for business cooperation. The graduate must be able to guide employees to build effective interactions and partnerships with government bodies and organizations within competencies.	Formal writing and public speaking, Professional communications and conflict management, Organizational culture and ethics, Collaborative and Participatory Governance, Crisis negotiation techniques	https://www.apa.kz/ru/admission-ru/magistratura/
NJSC "Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilyov"	The discipline "Conflict Management" helps to master the skills to optimize interaction with staff and clients and establish cooperative relationships.	Conflict Management	https://fe.enu.kz/ru/page/departments/department-of-management/educational-programs
Kazakh National University named after al-Farabi	The learning outcomes include skills in identifying causes and the ability to prevent social conflicts in society. Within the framework of HR technology in the public service, the basics of communication technologies and standards of official ethics, organization of groups, and teamwork are studied. "Management Psychology" is related to the fundamentals of effective interaction and overcoming conflicts, self-development, and self-presentation. "PR in public authorities" - about the peculiarities of interaction between society and government institutions, communication between various subjects of public relations with citizens and organizations to ensure transparency and strengthen the role of public control in the state.	Management psychology, HR technologies in the public service; PR in government bodies	https://www.kaznu.kz/ru/24986/page/ https://welcome.kaznu.kz/ru/education_programs/magistracy/speciality/1552#general

Narxoz University	Understand and apply organization theory, management concepts, and behavior. Possess critical communication skills. Establish networking interactions and partnerships, work with governmental and non-governmental organizations and active public groups, and be able to communicate. Studying "Management of Social Processes" involves assessing the current state of the mechanism for regulating social processes within the country to develop a strategy for social relations between various subjects.	Psychology of management; Social process management	https://narxoz.edu.kz/slpp/master-in-public-policy/public-policy/ https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/49536
JSC "Almaty Technological University"	The training results indicate communication abilities to solve professional problems of interpersonal interaction; the EP graduate will be motivated to communicate with a professional audience and non-specialists. In addition, during the training, the master's student will gain skills in team management and tolerantly perceiving social, ethical, religious, and cultural differences. Within Management Psychology, team management skills are developed, considering social, ethical, religious, and cultural differences.	Psychology of management	https://drive.google.com/file/d/1Wn4eqUPbDI-lkm2Wk_pEH3g1l3NMsWED/view
NJSC "East Kazakhstan University named after Sarsen Amanzholov"	The expected learning outcomes include effective interpersonal and team communications for the successful development of personnel policies and HR processes and the organization of the civil service in interaction with representatives of civil society institutions and stakeholders. The course "Leadership and Communications in Public Administration" develops skills in effectively organizing group work, resolving conflict situations, analyzing and designing interpersonal, group, and organizational communications, maintaining an optimal organizational structure, as well as skills in self-development, self-realization, using of creative potential and decision making in standard and non-standard situations.	Management psychology, Leadership and communications in public administration, State and civil society	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/50804
NJSC "Zhetysu University named after I. Zhansugurov"	The course "Psychology of Management" is devoted to the critical aspects of developing master's students' skills in using the technology of organizational behavior of the individual and establishing interpersonal relationships. "Professional Communications in the Field of Public Administration" examines problems in the field of communication in professional activities, concepts, types, principles, procedures, methods,	Psychology of management; Professional communications in the field of public administration; Leadership in an organization	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/52184

barriers, and fundamental elements of communication, as well as features of professional communications in public administration. Organizational Leadership develops the ability to analyze and design interpersonal, group, and organizational communications.

Karaganda University named after. E.A. Buketov	The learning outcomes indicate the communication skills of forming public opinion, image, and reputation of the organization in the public relations management system. Develops knowledge about the patterns of social relations. The course "Communications and Management of Public Relations" provides knowledge about communications and management of public relations in government bodies.	Psychology of management; Communications and public relations management	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/47091
Karaganda University of Kazpotrebsoyuz	Upon the training, it is expected to acquire knowledge and skills in written scientific communication.	Psychology of management	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program
Turan-Astana University	The graduate must be able to work with people, know the basics of interaction with customers and personnel management, and know the basics of the legal system and legislation in Kazakhstan and trends in social development. As of QED, within the framework of the disciplines indicated in the right column, the graduate will know the ethical standards of business relations, the basics of business communications, the principles and methods of organizing business communications, the essence of organizational culture, and the ability to resolve conflicts in a team.	Official ethics and conflict management in public service; Mechanisms for resolving conflict situations in a team; Modernization of public consciousness and legal culture	https://tau-edu.kz/specialty/gosudarstvennoe-i-mestnoe-upravlenie-naucno-pedagogiceskoe-napravlenie
Esil University	Possession of skills in effective teamwork and interdepartmental/interpersonal interaction. The ability to create and manage multi-dimensional communication. Within Management Psychology and State Social Policy, issues of interpersonal interaction and organization of interaction with partners are addressed.	Psychology of management	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/2682

Aktobe Regional University named after K. Zhubanov	The educational program merely highlights the importance of respect and attention to people.	Psychology of management	http://ef.arsu.kz/?page_id=2017&lang=ru
Humanitarian and Technical Academy	Within the disciplines "Management structures of public institutions" and "Ethics of a civil servant" there is a mention of collective interaction skills.	Ethics of a civil servant, Management structures of public institutions	https://drive.google.com/file/d/1eb-9jXJotQD7dFSK4mUoYd4T3WyjNQTT/view https://gta.edu.kz/education/education.php
Kostanay Regional University named after Akhmet Baitursynuly	During training in "Management Psychology" and "Corporate Governance", the student will gain skills in managing staff behavior and cooperation.	Psychology of management; Corporate governance	https://ksu.edu.kz/educational-activity/obrazovatelnye-programmy/magistratura/
Innovative Eurasian University	A graduate must demonstrate a readiness to communicate in oral and written forms, including in a foreign language, to solve professional problems. "Official Ethics and Conflict Management in the Public Service" programs instill domestic and foreign experience in the formation of moral behavior of civil servants.	Official ethics and conflict management in public service	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program
Caspian University of Technology and Engineering named after Sh. Yessenov	According to the specified learning outcomes - the master must be able to establish interpersonal communication and maintain the image of a civil servant. The course "Psychology of Management" examines the psychology of managing a workforce and the socio-psychological climate in the team. "Official ethics and conflict management in the public service" contributes to the acquisition of extensive and systematized knowledge in the theory and practice of business relationships with the priority of ethical standards and morality and methods of conflict resolution in the public service.	Psychology of management; Official ethics and conflict management in public service	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/37945
Kyzylorda University named after Korkyt ata	A graduate can build relationships with colleagues, government agencies, and other organizations to achieve strategic goals. "Theory and Practice of Public Administration" develops the interaction between the state and society in public administration.	Theory and practice of public administration	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/56517

North Kazakhstan University named after Manash Kozybayev	The EP states that the master must have the skills of free professional communication in different linguistic and cultural environments. "Management psychology" forms the principles of teamwork.	Psychology of management	https://ku.edu.kz/educationalProgram/passport?id=1083
Taraz Regional University named after M. Kh. Dulaty	Learning outcomes - to demonstrate knowledge of communicative competence of foreign language education and abilities in professional activities. "Professional Ethics of a Civil Servant" forms a culture of communication and the ethics of business negotiations. "GR communications" lays down skills in mastering tools for building relationships between private and public structures, organizing the interaction of public and business structures with government authorities, modern methods, and technologies of GR communications	Professional ethics of a civil servant; GR communications	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/47263
Toraigyrov University	Learning outcome: mastering basic communication skills in the state, Russian, and foreign languages (level B1, B2, C1), including in the professional field. "Psychology of Management" is about the patterns and mechanisms of mental regulation of people's behavior when they are included in various types of organizational and management systems and relationships. "PR in public authorities" contains the following topics: History and methodology of managing public relations as a field of activity necessary for every civil servant. The main directions of PR activities, public relations technologies, interaction of PR services with the media. Information and analytical methods and practical tasks are used.	Psychology of management; PR in government bodies	https://epvo.kz/#/register/education_program/application/56942

Table compiled by authors